Exhibit 61:

Mary Doe Deposition Transcript (redacted)

1	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
2	EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN SOUTHERN DIVISION
۷	SOUTHERN DIVISION
3	
4	JOHN DOES A, B, C, D, E, F, G,) H, MARY DOE and MARY ROE, on)
5	behalf of themselves and all)
6	others similarly situated,)
6) Plaintiffs,)File No.
7)2:22-cv-10209
,	-vs-)
8) HON. GOLDSMITH
	GRETCHEN WHITMER, Governor of) MAG. IVY, JR.
9	the State of Michigan, and)
1 0	COL. JOSEPH GASPER, Director)
10	of the Michigan State Police,) in their official capacities,)
11)
	Defendants.)
12	
13	REMOTE DEPOSITION
14	of MARY DOE, a Plaintiff called by Defendants,
15	taken before Melinda S. Nardone, Certified Shorthand
16	Reporter and Notary Public, via Zoom, on Monday, March
17	27, 2023, noticed for the hour of 10:00 a.m.
18	
19	
20	
21	
	HECKAMAN & NARDONE, INC.
22	Certified Shorthand Reporters
	P.O. Box 27603
23	Lansing, Michigan 48909
24	(517) 349-0847 msnardone5@gmail.com
<u> </u>	msnardonesegmarr.com
25	

1 of 33 sheets Page 1 to 1 of 86

- Case 2:22-cv-10209-MAG-Cl - ECF No. 125-1p, PageID.5207 - Filed 10/02/23 - Page 4 of 24

5

7

8

- 1 are asked. If you could wait until I finish asking the
- 2 question before you start answering it, when talking
- 3 over each other it makes it very hard for Mindy to write
- 4 down what's being said. And I'll do the same on my end
- **5** to the best of my ability not to talk over you.
- **6** Of course you're represented by counsel here
- 7 today who will probably have objections to some of my
- **8** guestioning. When that happens I ask that you let
- **9** counsel state their objections and then more often than
- 10 not you'll still have to provide an answer. If you
- 11 don't understand a question please say so and I'll do my
- **12** best to rephrase it. I prefer that you not guess at the
- 13 answer. I don't want you just to, like I said, guess at
- 14 what I'm asking you. If you don't understand what I'm
- **15** asking you please ask that I rephrase. I will take no
- 16 offense to that and I will be happy to do so and
- 17 rephrase the question. And so if you answer the
- 18 question I'm going to assume that you understood the
- 19 question; is that fair?
- 20 A. That is fair.
- **Q.** Excellent, okay. Are you taking any medication
- 22 or any substances that affects your ability to answer
- 23 the guestions truthfully today?
- 24 A. No.
- **Q.** Okay. Is there anything else that might

- 1 conviction of yours back in I believe 2003. Do you
- 2 expect questions around that; do you understand what I'm
- 3 talking about with that?
- 4 A. Yes.
 - **Q.** Okay. And since your release from prison in 2004
- **6** from your CSC conviction where have you lived?
 - A. I've lived all around Detroit metro area.
 - **Q.** So starting from when you were first released did
- 9 you -- where did you go, did you go to a specific house?
 - A. I did, I went home to my parents.
- 11 Q. Okay. And was that your choice or was it part of
- **12** a court order?
- 13 A. Both.
- **Q.** Could you please elaborate on that?
- 15 A. So when my conviction happened in Ohio there was
- 16 nothing for me in Ohio. And when I was released my
- 17 options were my parents. And my parents decided, you
- 18 know, this is our daughter, we support her for
- 19 everything, she'll come and live with us. And then it
- 20 was also, I want to say, I'm not positive, but in my
- 21 release it did say I was to live in Michigan with my
- 22 parents. I'm not positive on that.
- **Q.** Were you confused at all by that order when it
- 24 was issued?
- 25 A. A little because I knew I was going home to

-

- 1 interfere with your ability to testify truthfully today?
- 2 A. No.
- **Q.** Okay. Where are you currently located?
- 4 A. In Michigan.
- **5 Q.** Are you in metro Detroit area?
- 6 A. In the metro Detroit area.
- **Q.** Are you in a home right now or your personal
- 8 residence?
- 9 A. I do live in a home, personal residence.
- **10 Q.** And is that where you're located today?
- 11 A. Yes.
- **12 Q.** Do you own your home?
- 13 A. I do not.
- **14 Q.** You do not. So do you rent your home, correct?
- 15 A. Well, yes and no. So we moved in with my parents
- 16 to help finances and they are elderly, so we do pay half
- 17 of the mortgage.
- **18 Q**. Okay.
- 19 A. So I guess, 'cause it's not really rent, we
- 20 contribute half to everything.
- **21 Q.** So you live in Michigan, correct?
- 22 A. Correct.
- **Q.** And you still live in the metro Detroit area?
- A. Correct.
- **Q.** I'm going to be talking today about a CSC

- 1 Michigan and going home to my parents, but I couldn't
- 2 understand why if it was in there it was specific that I
- 3 had to live with them.
- **Q.** Did you seek any advice from counsel to fully
- **5** understand the order?
- 6 A. I don't remember.
- **Q.** Do you remember if you sought advice from anyone?
- 8 A. You know what, I really don't remember, you know,
- 9 it's 20 years ago.
- **10 Q.** Sure, understandable. So that was in 2004 you
- 11 went to your parents' house. Did you move anywhere else
- **12** from your parents' house after that?
 - A. I did.
- **14 Q**. Okay.

13

25

- 15 A. I have gotten married and me and my husband, we
- 16 lived in two other locations.
- 17 Q. So you left from your parents' house to another
- **18** location, correct?
- 19 A. Correct.
- **Q.** And was that location in the Detroit metro area?
- 21 A. Yes
- **Q.** And was it -- and so to leave from your parents'
- 23 house to go to this new location did you have to seek
- **24** approval from the court in Ohio?
 - A. No, I was already off probation, everything that

3 of 33 sheets Page 6 to 9 of 86

- 1 was done, from my understanding, once probation ended ${f I}$
- 2 was able to seek out wherever I wanted to reside.
- **Q.** And did you confer with anybody before you made
- **4** that move to make sure that it was okay?
- 5 A. No.
- **6 Q.** So then you went from your parents' house to
- 7 another location with your husband. How long of a gap
- **8** between your parents' house and the next location?
- 9 A. Seven years.
- 10 Q. Now, when you went to that second location since
- 11 you've been back to Michigan did you rent?
- 12 A. We rented.
- **Q.** Did you eventually own?
- 14 A. No
- **Q.** And then you mentioned a second location,
- **16** correct?
- 17 A. Correct.
- **Q.** So how long of a gap between the first location
- 19 with your husband and the second location, how long of a
- 20 gap of time was that?
- 21 A. Three years.
- **Q.** And was that third location also in the Detroit
- 23 metro area?
- 24 A. Yes.
- **Q.** Did you rent that location or did you purchase?

- 1 couldn't live within, I want to say, 2000 feet of a
- 2 school. So finding a location in a neighborhood not
- 3 near a school, not near a park, not near, you know, a
- 4 place of worship, was very, very difficult.
- **Q.** Did you have to fill out an application? You
- **6** mentioned that you rented; did you have to fill out a
- **7** rental application at all?
- 8 A. Yes, we did.
- **9 Q.** And do you recall if the rental application asked
- **10** about your CSC conviction?
 - A. It did not.
- 12 Q. It did not, okay. And then when you went to the
- 13 I'll say the overall third location in Michigan, first
- 14 there was the parents, then the first location with your
- 15 new husband, and then now the third location, did you
- **16** have any struggle making that move as well?
- 17 A. At that time, yes, because it was still those
- 18 restrictions. We wanted to stay in the city that we
- 19 were at but due to where some of the rental properties
- 20 were we couldn't live there because they were within
- 21 those school districts.
- **Q.** Were those the only restrictions that made it
- 23 hard for you to move?
- 24 A. At that time it was just a lot with all the
- 25 restrictions of, you know, not being near a park, not

1

- 1 A. We rented.
- **Q.** And from that third location did you move
- 3 anywhere else?
- 4 A. Yes, to where we are at now.
- **5 Q.** And just to confirm, you're currently located,
- 6 your current residence, is in the Detroit metro area,
- **7** correct?
- 8 A. Correct.
- **9 Q.** And how long of a gap between your third location
- **10** and your current location was there?
- 11 A. Six years.
- **Q.** And then how long have you been at your current
- **13** location?
- 14 A. Three and a half years.
- **Q.** So roughly 2021 you moved to your current
- 16 location?

18

- 17 A. 2019, right before the pandemic.
 - **Q.** They didn't hire me for my math skills. Going
- 19 back to your first move from your parents to the second
- 20 location, did you struggle finding a place to live when
- 21 you met your new husband?
- 22 A. We did.
- 23 Q. Could you explain to me what struggles you
- 24 incurred?
- 25 A. Being on the public registry at that time I

- 1 being near, you know, a place of worship, schools. It
- 2 was a huge difficulty and also being on the public
- 3 registry, you know, was extremely hard because if there
- 4 was on the rental application, you know, have you ever
- 5 been convicted of a felony or anything, then, yes, I
- 6 would answer that truthfully.
- 7 Q. Now, did you apply for any places to live that
- **8** had that information on its application?
- 9 A. There was one that we looked at, I want to
- 10 recall, that did have that and we decided not to apply
- 11 to it.
- **Q.** But you still found a place to live despite that,
- 13 correct?
- 14 A. Eventually, yes.
- **Q.** Okay. So aside from it being around the schools
- **16** and places of worship, there were no other instances
- 17 that made it difficult for you to gain housing?
- 18 A. Well, besides funds, that might have been -- I
- 19 want to say that might have been it, you know, it's hard
- 20 to recall every instance that happened.
- **21 Q**. Okay.
- 22 A. You know, I knew I had to report, you know,
- 23 within three days, you know, wherever I moved to.
- **Q.** Okay. When you moved from your third location to
 - your current location do you remember what year it was

8

10

- **1** that you moved?
- 2 A. 2019.
- **Q.** Okay. And did you suffer any hardship in finding
- 4 a place to move, that would have been the third
- 5 time -- fourth time?
- 6 A. No.
- **Q.** No. Is that because the school restrictions and
- 8 the worship restrictions were no longer part of the law?
- 9 A. That helped and also not being on the public
- 10 registry helped 'cause I didn't have to worry about
- 11 someone come knocking on my door, which had happened to
- 12 us in the past.
- **Q.** Okay, but just focusing on your attempts to
- 14 achieve a place to live and rent, did being on the
- 15 registry prevent you at all from being able to rent at
- **16** your current location?
- 17 A. No.
- **18 Q.** So it's fair to say you didn't have trouble
- **19** finding suitable housing because of your CSC history to
- 20 get to your current location; is that correct?
- 21 A. From -- I'm sorry, the abbreviation is for?
- **Q.** Criminal sexual conduct.
- A. Well, that and the registry, I did not have an
- 24 issue finding where we live now.
- **25 Q.** Okay. You mentioned you're currently married,

- 1 receive any advice regarding your civil divorce while
- 2 you were incarcerated?
 - A. Yes.
- **Q.** Okay. And why did you seek out advice from an
- **5** attorney during that divorce?
- **6** MS. DAVIDSON: I'm going to object to the
- 7 extent that any answer she gives could be privileged.
 - MR. DAMICH: Okay.
- 9 BY MR. DAMICH:
 - Q. Did you seek advice because you weren't
- 11 knowledgeable about current divorce laws?
- 12 A. It was supposed to be a very easy divorce and my 13 ex-husband had made it extremely difficult. And it was
- 14 my parents that had found my divorce attorney for me.
- **15 Q.** I'm sorry it was difficult. During that
- 16 difficult time were there actions that he was taking
- 17 that you didn't understand why legally they were
- 18 happening?
- 19 A. He would send me information and my mom would
- 20 also send me information to clarify any questions that ${f I}$
- 21 had.
- 22 Q. Okay.
- 23 A. I knew he was working on things in the background
- 24 so there wasn't much for me to do while I was
- 25 incarcerated. My biggest thing was to make sure that I

15

- 1 correct?
- 2 A. Correct.
- **Q.** And how long have you been married?
- 4 A. We just celebrated 13 years.
- **5 Q.** Congratulations. Were you previously married?
- 6 A. I was.
- **7 Q.** So there was a divorce?
- 8 A. Yes.
- **9 Q.** And when did that divorce occur?
- 10 A. 2004 was our civil divorce. We had a judi- -- a
- 11 Jewish divorce September of 2003.
- **Q.** Okay. Focusing on the civil divorce, were you
- **13** incarcerated at the time that happened?
- 14 A. When we got divorced I was already out.
- **15 Q.** Now, from my understanding a divorce proceeding
- **16** doesn't happen just overnight. Did the divorce
- 17 proceeding start while you were incarcerated?
- 18 A. Yes.
- **19 Q.** And did you receive the advice of counsel during
- 20 that process while you were incarcerated?
- 21 A. From which attorney?
- **Q.** How many attorneys did you have at that point?
- 23 A. I had my divorce attorney and my criminal
- 24 attorney
- **Q.** Okay. So from your divorce attorney did you

- 1 did everything that I needed to do to get out, come
- 2 home, and get divorced.
- **Q.** Okay. So is it fair to say that you sought his
- 4 legal advice because you did not fully understand the
- **5** divorce laws at that time?
- 6 A. That's correct.
- **Q**. Now, you also mentioned your criminal attorney;
- 8 was he or she part of the civil divorce process as well?
- 9 A. No.
- 10 Q. And did either your civil divorce attorney or
- 11 criminal attorney visit you while you were incarcerated?
- 12 A. No

- Q. No. Did you have conversations with either of
- **14** them while you were incarcerated?
- 15 A. Yes.
- **Q.** And to the best of your knowledge were those
- **17** conversations private?
- 18 A. Well, they were either on the phone or through 19 mail.
- Q. And when you were on the phone were you byyourself or were there other people around you?
- 22 A. To the best of my rec- -- to the best that I can
- 23 recall there were other inmates around me when I was
- 24 talking to my attorneys. It wasn't like I was taken to
- 25 a private room and like, oh, here's a phone call from

23

24

25

registry.

Q. Did she apply to any schools of higher education

A. In middle school she applied to a school and was

and was denied because you were on the public registry?

22

23

24

25

Q. Okay. And did custody change at all after that?

school up in Michigan that I had her Wednesdays and

A. Eventually it changed when she started to come to

every other weekend, I had her four weeks in the summer.

- 1 denied because of my CSC and public registry.
- **Q.** In middle school?
- 3 A. Yes.
- **Q.** Okay. Did she suffer any of the same denial when
- **5** she went on to high school?
- 6 A. When she was enrolled in high school she was
- 7 enrolled originally under my ex-husband, and when I took
- 8 over there were then issues with me being the custodial
- 9 parent.
- 10 Q. And what type of issues were those?
- 11 A. Parent/teacher conferences, school work, getting
- 12 answers from teachers. She was singled out a lot, I
- 13 feel, because of not only my CSC and public registry,
- 14 because her stepfather is not Jewish so I want to say
- 15 there were a lot of factors that played in, but a lot of
- 16 it had to do also with my criminal background and public
- 17 registry.
- **Q.** Did she graduate high school within four years?
- 19 A. Yes
- **Q.** And did she go immediately to college after
- 21 graduation?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. And then after graduation from undergrad did she
- 24 go directly to her graduate studies?
- 25 A. No.

- A. The 13 year old, I pick him up once a week from
- 2 school, we spend the afternoons together. I help him
- 3 with his homework, I go to his events at school. Our
- 4 oldest grandson, we go to all of his football games. We
- 5 used to go to our oldest granddaughter's cheerleading
- 6 events. So the other two, because they are younger
- 7 there isn't much that they are really involved in just
- 8 yet.
- **9 Q.** Do you do any babysitting or anything like that?
- 10 A. With my 13 year old I have him, like I said,
- 11 every -- I have him once a week and we spend time.
- **Q.** And you said ranging from two months old; is that
- 13 correct?

16

1

2

4

- 14 A. The two month old, yes, they are out of state.
- **Q.** Do you visit them often?
 - A. We have yet to see her yet so....
- 17 Q. So now your oldest son lives out of state; is
- 18 that accurate?
- 19 A. Yes.
- **20 Q.** And so he has four children?
- 21 A. Yes.
- **Q.** How often do you go see your out-of-state son?
- 23 A. We have yet to go out of state to see him.
- **Q.** So you haven't visited your oldest stepson since
- 25 you've been married?

2.

- Q. Did she gain employment after high school?
- 2 A. She gained employment in high school too so....
- **Q.** Okay. Do you have any grandchildren?
- 4 A. I do.
- **5 Q.** How many do you have?
- 6 A. Five.
- **7 Q.** Five, congratulations.
- 8 A. Thank you.
- **9 Q.** And are they all to one of your three children or
- 10 are they spread out?
- 11 A. Spread out.
- **12 Q.** Okay, what --
- 13 A. So our oldest son has four ranging from age 17 to
- 14 two months, and then our oldest daughter has one who
- 15 just turned 13.
- **Q.** And now your daughter that you had with your
- 17 ex-husband, does she have any children?
- 18 A. No.
- **19 Q.** And then you said the oldest son is 17?
- 20 A. The oldest grandchild is 17.
- **21 Q.** All right, oldest grandchild is 17. Are you
- 22 involved in your grandchildren's lives?
- 23 A. I am
- 24 Q. And to what extent are you involved in their
- 25 lives?

- A. No, no, he moved -- within the past year he moved out of state.
- 3 Q. Okay.
 - A. But when he was in state, you know, we'd see him,
- 5 you know -- my husband saw him every day because they
- 6 sometimes worked together.
- **Q.** Now do they still work together at times?
- 8 A. No
- **9 Q.** No. Is that just because of the distance?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. Have they ever talked about perhaps maybe joining
- **12** back up and working together in the future?
 - A. No.
- **Q.** Have you ever had any interest in moving back to
- **15** Ohio?

13

- 16 A. No.
- 17 Q. And why is that?
- 18 A. There's nothing there for me. Everything is
- 19 either here in Michigan or down south in Alabama or
- Q. So you wouldn't move to Ohio to be closer to yourqrandchildren and to help out the oldest son?
- A. Well, my grandchildren live in the Detroit metro area, my older ones. And my son lives out of state witl
- area, my older ones. And my son lives out of state with
 his new wife and the baby, so the other three that he
- 7 of 33 sheets Page 22 to 25 of 86

17 Q. Do you recall whether you had to report to law

18 enforcement that you were attending that institute?

19 A. I did.

20 Q. And how often?

21 A. When I did my verifications until I completed my

22 study, once that was done I went back up and let them

23 know I was no longer attending.

24 **Q.** And did having a CSC conviction prevent you from 25

attending any classes and obtaining your certification?

Q. Was that successful?

18 A. It was, I worked there for about six months.

Q. And what did you do there?

20 A. Cashier.

21 Q. And was the employer a service provider, were

22 they a retailer?

23 A. Retail of food.

24 **Q.** And what did you do for them again, I'm sorry?

A. I was a cashier.

19

Case 2:22-cv-10209-MAG-CI ECF No. 125-10, PageID.5213 Filed 10/02/23 Page 10 of 24

2

5

16

- 1 Q. Cashier. And that started May 20th, 2004, you
- 2 said it lasted six months. After that what was your
- 3 next employment date?
- 4 A. It was January of 2005.
- **Q.** And what did you do in January of 2005?
- 6 A. I was an afternoon dispatcher. I started out, I
- ${f 7}$ should say, as an afternoon dispatcher for a heating and
- 8 cooling company.
- **9 Q.** How long did you stay at that job?
- 10 A. Five years, six years.
- **11 Q.** And did you apply for that position?
- 12 A. No, actually it was someone that I wound up
- 13 meeting, his brother owned -- his brother-in-law owned
- 14 this heating and cooling place and I went in to
- 15 interview and was offered the position.
- **16 Q.** Awesome. So between the first and second job
- 17 that we just talked about did you apply anywhere else?
- 18 A. Yeah, there were lots of places I applied.
- **19 Q.** Okay. Can you give me a rough estimation of how
- 20 many different places?
- 21 A. At least, you know, two, three dozen places.
- **Q.** So you were unemployed, it seems like, from
- 23 November to January and you said you applied to two or
- 24 three dozen places?
- 25 A. Uh-huh. Oh, sorry, correct.

- 1 Michigan's sex offender registry?
 - A. That one did not.
- **Q.** It did not. Did it have a question regarding if
- 4 you were previously convicted of any felonies?
 - A. It did not.
- **6 Q.** And so between those two jobs, the one you
- 7 started in January 2005 and then the one you started in
- 8 mid 2010, did you apply for any other positions?
- 9 A. No.
- **Q.** Did you receive a pay raise?
- 11 A. I did.
- **12 Q.** Was it significant?
- 13 A. It was.
- **14 Q.** How about benefits?
- 15 A. Yes, those too.
 - **Q.** Did you have benefits in your previous position?
- 17 A. Towards the end of my employment I did.
- **Q.** Okay, but then for your new position the benefits
- 19 got much better?
- 20 A. Yes.
- **Q.** Okay. And so how long did you stay at that
- 22 position?
- 23 A. A year.
- **Q.** Okay. So we'll say mid 2011?
- 25 A. Yes.

1

31

- Q. And do you remember if those applications asked
- 2 if you were on the Michigan's public registry?
- 3 A. I don't remember if all of them did. I know a
- 4 couple of the places I applied to it asked if I had ever
- ${\bf 5}$ $\,$ been convicted of a felony. I don't know at that time
- 6 if they asked about the public registry, but I do know
 7 that because of my conviction to some of the places I
- 7 that because of my conviction to some of the places I
- 8 applied to I was told they wouldn't hire me because of
- 9 my felony.

1

- **10 Q.** So as of today you don't remember any of those
- 11 two or three dozen applications having a specific
- **12** question of whether or not you were on Michigan's public
- 13 registry?
- 14 A. No, I don't.
- **15 Q.** And so your second job starting in January 2005,
- **16** you said you were there for how many years?
- 17 A. About five years.
- **Q.** And then where did you go after that?
- 19 A. I went to another heating and cooling company.
- **Q.** Do you remember around about when that was?
- 21 A. 2000- -- mid 2010.
- **Q.** Did you apply for that position?
- 23 A. I did.
- **Q.** And do you remember if that application had a
- 25 question regarding your status as a registrant on

- Q. And then where did you go?
- 2 A. That's when I started school, I was let go and I
- 3 started school.
 - Q. Why were you let go?
- 5 A. I was told there was an issue with me and the
- 6 office manager. Come to find out it had to do with
- 7 people knowing about my conviction and me being on the
- 8 registry.
- **9 Q.** Okay. And how did you come to know that that was
- **10** the reason for your firing or being let go?
- 11 A. I still kept very much in contact with a lot of
- 12 the sales reps and service technicians. You know, of
- 13 course, it's secondhand knowledge, I never got the
- 14 direct, you know, if this was really true from the
- 15 owner.
- **Q.** Sure. So did the sales reps and service techs,
- 17 were they the ones that let you go?
- 18 A. No
 - Q. Okay. Now, you said there was an issue with the
- 20 office manager; would you mind explaining what that was
- 21 about?

19

- 22 A. You know, I work hard, I work fast, I type very
- 23 fast, and I was just very efficient and I'm not sure
- 24 exactly what the office manager and me were even
- 25 disagreeing about. I didn't think there were any

9 of 33 sheets Page 30 to 33 of 86

- 1 disagreements. I thought I did my job to the best of my
- 2 abilities, so I didn't know for sure exactly why, you
- $3\,$ $\,$ know, she decided to say, you know, we're going to let
- 4 you go
- **Q.** Did you seek legal redress against that company
- 6 for letting you go?
- 7 A. No.
- **Q.** Did you look into any options of doing so?
- 9 A. No.
- **10 Q.** Do you have any document or anything in writing
- 11 saying that the reason you were let go is because they
- 12 noticed you were on the Michigan sex offender
- **13** registration?
- 14 A. No.
- **15 Q.** Okay. So after your third job after you were let
- **16** go you went to school, correct?
- 17 A. Correct.
- **Q.** Okay. So then after school -- I think you said
- **19** you graduated in 2011, right?
- 20 A. Yeah, it was 2011, 2012 area.
- 21 Q. Okay. So then did you gain employment after
- **22** that?

- 23 A. I did.
- 24 Q. Okay. Do you remember when?
- 25 A. It had to be about 2012.

- 1 try to find a second job because you were not a
- 2 full-time employee?
- 3 A. No.
- **Q.** So then after that position where did you go?
- 5 A. I went back to one of the heating and cooling 6 places.
- **7 Q.** Which one was it?
 - A. The second one.
- **9 Q.** And did you experience a pay increase?
- 10 A. Yes.

8

- 11 Q. Significant?
- 12 A. Significant.
- **Q.** And the same with benefits?
- 14 A. Yes.
- **15 Q.** Okay. And what were your responsibilities in
- 16 that job?
- 17 A. I was the installer, dispatcher, commercial
- 18 installations, rebates, warranty, new construction.
- **19 Q.** So did you deal a lot with warranties, written
- 20 warranties, and that kind of stuff?
- 21 A. It was more of submitting their equipment for
- 22 their warranties and then verifying if the equipment was
- 23 still under warranty if they used our company.
- **Q.** I see. Were there ever any instances where you
- 25 weren't so sure if something was under warranty or not?

35

- **Q.** Did you apply for the position?
- 2 A. I did.
- **Q.** Do you remember if that application had a
- **4** specific question regarding if you're a registrant on
- 5 the Michigan sex offender registration?
- 6 A. It did not.
- **Q**. Do you remember if the application asked about
- 8 prior felony convictions?
- 9 A. It did not.
- 10 Q. Did not, okay. This new position, was it similar
- 11 to your previous positions in was it a service provider,
- 12 retailer?
- 13 A. It was a doctor's office so I was actually doing
- 14 medical insurance billing and coding.
- **Q.** Your compensation, was it higher or lower than
- 16 your previous position?
- 17 A. It was about the same.
- 18 Q. About the same. Benefits?
- 19 A. No, because I worked -- I was not full time.
- **Q.** Was that your choice to not be full time or was
- 21 that part of the employment?
- 22 A. Part of the employment.
- **Q.** How long did you stay at that position for?
- 24 A. Seven and a half months.
- **Q.** And during those seven and a half months did you

- A. Always.
- 2 Q. Always. And what would you do then if you didn't
- 3 understand if something was under warranty or not?
 - A. There were times that I knew also a lot of the
- 5 wholesalers and I could reach out to some of them to
- 6 find out for sure what under the equipment was under
- 7 warranty.

1

10

- **Q.** And so that started -- and that position, I'm
- **9** sorry, that started in 2013?
 - A. Correct.
- **11 Q.** And how long did you stay there?
- 12 A. A year.
- **Q.** And why did you leave?
- 14 A. I was let go again.
- **Q.** Do you remember why you were let go?
- 16 A. There was a customer that had an installation
- 17 scheduled that one of the other ladies had scheduled and
- 18 didn't inform the customer so I became the fall guy,
- 19 yeah.
- **Q.** Sorry about that. So it didn't have anything to
- 21 do with your status as being a registrant on the
- 22 Michigan sex offender registration?
- 23 A. No, the owner knew.
- **Q.** The owner knew?
 - A. Yeah.

25

Case 2:22-cv-10209-MAG-CI ECF No. , PageID.5215 Filed 10/02/23 Page 12 of

5

8

10

14

22

1

- 1 Q. Okay. And he was fine with you still being an
- employee? 2
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. And you said that from -- where did you go after
- 5 that?
- 6 A. At that point I was unemployed for a while and 7 then I wound up at a temp agency.
- 8 Q. Okay. And so do you remember around about how
- 9 long you were unemployed?
- 10 A. I know I started around the temp agency around
- 11 2015 to 2016.
- 12 Q. Okay. So you were unemployed for maybe roughly a
- 13 few months?
- 14 A. About.
- 15 Q. And when you sought the services of a temp agency
- 16 did they ask whether or not you were a registrant on
- Michigan sex offender registry? 17
- 18 A. They did not.
- 19 Q. Did they ask about prior convictions, criminal
- 20 convictions?
- 21 A. There was a box on there for it and I know that
- 22 they did a background check, but because it was already
- 23 more than seven years out my background check didn't
- 24 come up with my felony. And at that time I was also off
- 25 of the public registry.

- A. The new one that I just left, the one that I was
- there for five and a half years, I'm with that employer. 2
- 3 Q. Okay. So then you worked for -- what did you do
- 4 for this employer that you started with in July 2022?
 - A. I worked for their accounting division.
- 6 Q. Then just to confirm, you received a significant
- 7 pay raise from your previous job, correct?
 - A. Correct.
- 9 **Q.** And then did you leave that position?
 - A. No, I'm still with this position.
- 11 Q. Okay. So it seems like you had what seven
- 12 different positions since you've been released from
- 13 prison?
 - A. It seems about right.
- 15 Q. So is it fair to say that even with your CSC
- 16 conviction you've been able to maintain employment?
- 17 A. Yes and no 'cause I do know for sure one of the
- 18 jobs I had I was let go because of not only my CSC but 19 also being on the public registry. I even had one owner
- 20
- tell me if he knew that I had a felony and was on the
- 21 registry he would never have hired me.
 - Q. Is that the same employer?
- 23 A. Two different employers.
- 24 Q. But the one that said if he had known, did he
- 25 fire you?

- 1 Q. And so the temp agency, do you remember the
- 2 different places where you were placed while you were at
- 3 the temp agency?
- 4 A. I was only placed at one place that wound up
- 5 hiring me in.
- 6 **Q.** And so when were you placed at that employer?
- 7 A. I started with them January of 2017.
- 8 **Q.** And are you still employed with that employer?
- 9 A. No, I left.
- 10 Q. And when did you leave?
- 11 A. I left June of 2022.
- 12 **Q.** And why did you leave?
- 13 A. I found a position that offered a huge increase
- 14 in salary and much better benefits.
- 15 Q. And so that start would it be -- how much of a
- 16 gap in time between the place you found through the temp
- 17 agency and the new employer where there was a
- 18 significant raise?
- 19 A. I was with so the temp agency and then they hired
- 20 me in that position and I was there for five and a half
- 21
- 22 **Q.** So then does July 20th, 2022, sound right?
- 23
- 24 Q. So five years, say does November sound right,
- 25 November of -- are you still with this employer?

- A. No, I wound up eventually leaving that one.
- 2 **Q**. Okay.
- A. And a lot of times I will also say that when I
- would get through most of the paperwork and there was
- 5 the check box for the felony, I never really saw
- 6 anything about the public registry that I can recall,
- 7 but when it came to the felony and it said -- you know,
- and if it didn't say, you know, seven years, that they
- only go back seven years, I just -- I would stop my
- 10 application because I knew right then and there they
- 11 wouldn't have hired me.
- 12 **Q.** Okay. So it was the result of the actual felony
- 13 conviction itself not being listed on the public
- 14 registry then?
- 15 A. Because the public registry wasn't one of the questions. 16
- 17
- Q. Okay, makes sense. Do you currently have an
- 18 Instagram account?
 - A. I do but I don't use it.
- 20 Q. How long have you had an Instagram account?
- 21 A. A year.
 - Q. How about a LinkedIn account?
- 23
- 24 Q. And how long have you had the LinkedIn account
- 25 for?

19

8

13

22

- 1 A. I've had it for about five years.
- 2 **Q.** Do you have any other forms of social media?
- 3 A. I do.
- 4 Q. Okay, what other forms do you have?
- 5 A. I do have Facebook to keep in constant
- 6 communication with my family that is all over the world.
- 7 Q. Sure. And how long have you had Facebook?
- 8 A. About five years.
- 9 Q. So is it fair to say that even with your CSC
- 10 conviction you've been able to maintain social media
- 11 accounts?
- 12 A. With that and not being on the public registry
- 13 I've been able to.
- 14 Q. Do you know where on the public registry it
- prevents you from having social media accounts? 15
- 16 A. I do not.
- 17 **Q.** But from your understanding the registry prevents
- 18 you from having those accounts?
- 19 A. From when I was first on the public registry,
- 20 yes.

1

- 21 **Q.** Where did you gain that understanding from?
- 22 A. Reading the very first line items when I first
- 23 went on the registry it talked about, you know, social
- 24 media, it talked about email accounts. You know, having
- 25 to list everything like that I stayed away.

- social media account?
 - A. I did not.
 - 3 Q. Okay. So is it fair to say that you just assumed
 - that you weren't allowed to have those accounts? 4
 - A. That's fair to say.
 - 6 MR. DAMICH: Do you mind if we take a five
- 7 minute break?
 - THE WITNESS: That's fine.
- 9 MR. DAMICH: Okay, we'll be back in five
- 10 minutes?
- THE WITNESS: Five minutes. 11
- 12 MR. DAMICH: Thank you.
 - (A recess was taken.)
- BY MR. DAMICH: 14
- Q. Okay, I want to discuss a little bit about your 15
- 16 conviction. You were convicted in 2003 of unlawful
- sexual conduct with a minor, right? 17
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Okay. And the victim was a 15 year old child,
- 20 correct?
- 21 A. Yes.
 - Q. And you had sex with this 15 year old child,
- 23 correct?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. Okay. Did you also exchange sexually lewd

- Q. So, again, you said that you weren't allowed to
- 2 have social media accounts; is it more you just didn't
- 3 want to list them all out?
- 4 A. I guess I don't understand the guestion.
- 5 Q. Sure. I asked from where you gained the
- 6 understanding that you weren't allowed to have social
- 7 media accounts, and from my understanding of your
- 8 response you referred to the information you have to 9
- fill out about how you'd be identified on the internet,
- 10 correct?
- 11 A. Correct.
- 12 Q. Now, is it your understanding that being asked to
- 13 identify your specific names and where you're registered
- 14 on the internet is a denial or restriction of your
- 15 ability to be on social media?
- 16 A. That's a good question. I guess when I first
- 17 signed up and everything like social media was not as
- 18 big as it is now, and when I first signed everything it
- 19 had mentioned about, you know -- I don't think Facebook
- 20 was out at that time, I think it was Myspace was out at
- 21 that time. I want to say it mentioned something about
- 22 not having social media accounts. I cannot remember
- 23 exactly, but I want to say I saw somewhere in there.
- 24 Q. Okay. Do you remember asking any questions of
- 25 any authorities of whether or not you could have a

- communications with this 15 year old child? 1
 - 2 A. I don't recall all of it so I don't know.
- 3 Q. Did you exchange emails with the 15 year old
- child? 4
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. And were the emails of a sexual nature at all?
- 7 A. I don't recall.
- 8 Q. Did the 15 year old child have a special
- relationship with your husband at the time the unlawful
- sexual conduct occurred? 10
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. And what was that special relationship?
- 13 A. He was in the process of becoming orthodoxed like
- 14 a lot of the Jewish teenagers and kids in the area,
- 15 orthodox Judaism was very present in the area where we
- 16 were living. So we had a lot of teenagers in and out of
- 17 our home multiple occasions, staying over weekends for
- 18 the Sabbath, being able to be close to the synagogue in
- 19 walking distance.
- 20 **Q.** And were you attracted to the 15 year old child?
- 21 A. I don't recall.
 - Q. How many times did you have sex with the 15 year
- 23
- 24 A. I don't know. I don't even recall that, how many
- 25 times.

22

PageID.5217 Filed 10/02/23 Page 14 of 24 Case 2:22-cv-10209-MAG-Cl- 1 Q. Was it more than once? THE WITNESS: Oh, sorry, you know, like I 2 A. Yes. 2 said, I wouldn't know. 3 Q. Was it more than five times? 3 BY MR. DAMICH: 4 Q. Okay. In your opinion can a 15 year old child A. Possibly, yes. 5 Was it more than 20? consent to having sex with an adult? 6 A. No. A. No. 7 **Q**. 15? Q. In your opinion does a 15 year old have a 7 8 A. Maybe less than that, maybe. 8 maturity level to consent to having sex with an adult? 9 Q. So somewhere between as many times as 15 and at 9 MS. DAVIDSON: Objection, foundation. You 10 least five times? 10 can answer. 11 11 A. Yeah, somewhere in there I would say. THE WITNESS: That's -- you know, I'm going 12 Q. How many charges of unlawful sexual conduct were 12 to say no. 13 13 brought against you, do you remember? BY MR. DAMICH: 14 A. I don't. 14 Q. In your opinion should an adult exchange sexually lewd electronic messages with a 15 year old? 15 Q. Were there multiple charges -- excuse me, were 15 16 16 there multiple charges? 17 A. I don't recall. I know I took a plea. 17 Q. As you sit here today do you think it's okay for 18 Q. And what did you plea to? a 29 year old adult to have sex with a 15 year old 18 19 A. One count of unlawful sexual conduct with a 19 child? 20 minor. 20 A. No. 21 21 Q. How did you get caught? Q. Okay. Since 2003 have you had any other sexual 22 22 relationships with children 17 years or under? A. His mom put some type of spyware on his computer 23 and we were instant messaging at the time, I think it A. No. 24 was like AOL had a messaging system. And she found out, 24 Q. Are you sexually attracted to children? 25 went to the rabbi. And then from there I went and told 25 A. No. 1 my ex-husband, and from there he called his therapist, 1 Q. Were you sexually attracted to children at the 2 and from there the therapist called child protective 2 time that the events happened? 3 services. 3 A. No. 4 Q. Do you remember the nature of those instant 4 Q. Did you believe he wasn't a child? 5 messages? 5 A. No. A. I don't. 6 6 **Q.** Because you knew he was a child? 7 7 Q. Do you know whether or not the 15 year old A. Teenager, yes. 8 completed his religious studies? 8 Q. Okay. So was it just more for want and need of 9 A. From what I heard he never did. 9 sex? 10 Q. Okay. In your opinion do you think that your 10 A. No. 11 11 actions had a direct impact on that? Q. Okay, then why did you do it? 12 12 MS. DAVIDSON: Objection, calls for MS. DAVIDSON: Objection, relevance. You 13 speculation. You can answer. 13 can still answer. 14 THE WITNESS: It's possible. There's a lot 14 THE WITNESS: I don't have an answer, I 15 of factors. With him not being in an orthodox Jewish 15 really don't. I ask myself that question every day. household you never know which way a child might go. 16 16 BY MR. DAMICH: 17 17 BY MR. DAMICH: Q. Okay. Do you think a 15 year old that has sex 18 Q. In your opinion do you think having sex with a 29 18 with a 29 year old, that would impact the male's ability year old would impact a child's want to proceed with a to develop mentally? 19 19 20 religious education? 20 MS. DAVIDSON: Objection, foundation. She's 21 MS. DAVIDSON: Objection, calls for 21 not qualified to talk about that, she's not an expert. 22 22

BY MR. DAMICH:

Q. In your opinion do you think having sex with -- a 29 year old having sex with a 15 year old would stymie

their development as a human being?

23

24

THE WITNESS: Am I supposed to answer?

speculation, foundation.

MR. DAMICH: Yes.

MS. DAVIDSON: Yes.

23

24

5

7

1 MS. DAVIDSON: Same objection.

2 BY MR. DAMICH:

Q. You still have to answer.

4 A. Oh, sorry. It's a yes and a no, you know. It's

5 on an individual basis I want to say.

6 Q. Do you know if the 15 year old child went on to

7 higher education at all?

8 A. I do not know.

9 Q. Do you know whether or not he's married?

10 A. I do not know.

11 Q. Are you attracted to children now?

12 A. No.

MS. DAVIDSON: Objection, asked and

14 answered.

13

15 BY MR. DAMICH:

16 Q. The complaint indicates that, and I'm quoting

17 from the complaint, paragraph 71, that based upon a

18 psychological evaluation Ohio court concluded that you

19 were not a sexual predator. Are you familiar with that

20 allegation?

21 A. Yes.

Q. Okay. Can you explain to me the extent the

23 psychological evaluation referenced?

24 A. Can you elaborate or rephrase what you're asking?

25 Q. Sure. There was a psychological evaluation done,

1 A. I don't, I really don't.

Q. You don't remember any specific testing to

3 determine if you were a habitual offender?

A. I don't.

Q. Okay.

6 A. It was 20 years ago.

Q. Sure. Do you at least know how long this

8 evaluation lasted?

9 A. I don't.

Q. You don't recall?

11 A. I don't recall.

12 Q. Aside from the 2003 conviction have you been

13 arrested or charged with any other crimes?

14 A. A speeding ticket, that's it.

15 Q. And then when you moved to Michigan, I believe it

16 was in 2004, correct?

17 A. Correct.

Q. You had to register for 25 years, correct?

19 A. I was told Michigan I had to register for 25

20 years, Ohio it was ten years. And I was told that if I

21 only want to register for ten years then I should go

22 back to Ohio, where I proceeded to say there's nothing

23 for me in Ohio except my child.

Q. So then there's an allegation in the complaint

25 that the only way that you could come off Michigan's

51

correct, in Ohio?

2 A. Correct.

1

16

18

19

3 Q. Could you explain to me the nature and extent of

4 that psychological evaluation?

5 A. It was an evaluation I want to say, from my

6 recollection, of where I was at the time, what I was

7 thinking at the time, what was going on in my life at

8 the time. You know, do I understand my mistake, do I

9 understand what I did. So all those took part in that

10 evaluation.

11 Q. Do you know who did the evaluation?

12 A. I don't recall.

13 Q. Was it a doctor?

14 A. I want to say it might have been a court

15 counselor at the time, I don't recall.

Q. And do you recall if there was any specific

17 testing names that were associated with the evaluation?

A. I don't recall.

Q. In the same paragraph of the complaint it

20 indicates that the court determined that you are not a

21 habitual offender based on a psychological evaluation.

22 Are you familiar with that allegation?

23 A. Yes

24 Q. Do you remember what portion of the psychological

25 evaluation discussed you being a habitual offender?

1 registry was death, but you just said you could have

2 moved to Ohio, correct?

3 A. I could have, but there was nothing for me in

4 Ohio and also per me being released it was said that I'm

5 moving to Michigan to my parents.

6 Q. Is there anything preventing you now from moving

7 to Ohio?

8 A. There's nothing there for me.

9 Q. But is there anything preventing you from going

10 there?

11 MS. DAVIDSON: Objection, asked and

12 answered.

13 THE WITNESS: Like I said, there's nothing

14 there for me. My life is here with my husband.

15 BY MR. DAMICH:

16 Q. Is there a court order preventing you from going

17 to Ohio?

18 MS. DAVIDSON: Objection, asked and

19 answered.

20 THE WITNESS: Not that I'm aware of.

21 BY MR. DAMICH:

Q. You no longer have to -- do you still have to

23 register?

24 A. Yes.

Q. Okay. And what's the extent of registration you

- 1 have to do?
- 2 A. Verification of my address four times a year.
- **Q.** Okay. And where do you -- do you physically take
- **4** that somewhere?
- 5 A. Yes.
- **6 Q.** Okay, where do you take it?
- 7 A. To the state police department.
- **Q.** And how far away is that from where you currently
- 9 reside?
- 10 A. About five miles.
- **11 Q.** Okay. And how long does it take to register each
- 12 time you go?
- 13 A. It depends. If there's people in front of me it
- 14 can take 30 minutes to an hour. If there's nobody in
- 15 front of me it could take 20 to 35 minutes.
- **16 Q.** Do you visit the Secretary of State's office at
- **17** all?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. How often?
- 20 A. Only when I have to literally get a new picture
- 21 for my license.
- **Q.** So in the past four years how many times have you
- 23 been to the Secretary of State?
- 24 A. Twice.
- 25 Q. And how long were your visits then?

- 1 A. My mom never asked.
 - Q. If she would have asked would you discuss it with
- **3** her?
- A. Yes.
- **Q**. Okay. So just to be clear, you still have to
- **6** register but you're not on the public facing registry;
- 7 does that make sense?
- 8 A. Yes.
- **9 Q.** I'm going to share my screen here real guick if
- 10 you'll give me a second.
- 11 A. Uh-huh.
- **Q.** Okay, do you see it?
- 13 A. Yes.
- **14 Q.** Do you recognize this document?
- 15 A. Yes.
- **16 Q.** Can you generally describe what this document is?
- 17 A. It's my -- it says mail in update. Actually,
- 18 sorry, I have not seen this one 'cause it's a mail in
- 19 update.
- 20 Q. Okay.
- 21 A. Mine usually just says Michigan sex offender
- 22 registry.
- **Q.** Are you aware that you're able to mail in your
- 24 updates now?
- 25 A. I am unaware of that.

55

- A. Well, the first time I made an appointment but it
- 2 was still another hour and a half. And the second time
- 3 I made an appointment and I was taken right away.
- **Q.** Can we go back to when you were incarcerated?
- 5 Did you have a lot of people visit you in prison?
- 6 A. No.

1

- **7** Q. No. Did anyone call you?
- 8 A. No, just my mother.
- **9 Q.** Okay. And when you spoke with your mother were
- **10** you in a private room?
- 11 A. No.
- **12 Q.** No. So other people could hear your
- **13** conversation?
- 14 A. Yes.
- **15 Q.** And did you discuss with your mother the nature
- **16** and extent of the actions that got you in prison?
- 17 A. I told her I knew I made a mistake. And, you
- 18 know, she would keep me up-to-date because she saw my
- 19 daughter, and she would keep me up-to-date on how she
- 20 was doing and keep me up-to-date on how my dad was. And
- 21 at the time I still had some of a relationship with my
- 22 sisters so, you know, she let me know what was going on
- 23 with my sisters.
- **Q.** Okay. But did you ever get into the details of
- 25 what happened to get you into prison?

- Q. Looking through this information here, is this
- 2 the type of information that you have to report four
- 3 times a year?
 - A. Right now it's just my name and my address.
- **Q.** Okay. Nothing about vehicles or anything of that
- 6 sort?

- 7 A. No.
- **Q.** Do you find anything confusing about what you
- **9** have to report four times a year now?
- 10 A. Right now, no, because, like I said, it is just
- 11 all they are verifying is my address and my name.
- **12 Q.** Now, you said right now; why did you say right
- **13** now?
- 14 A. Because before it was all of this.
- **Q.** When you say all of this, all of the information
- 16 that's showing up on the document that I'm sharing with
- **17** you?
- 18 A. Yes, it was the address, it was my telephone
- 19 numbers, my emails, make and model of my vehicles, it
- 20 was all of it.
- 21 Q. Okay. And was any of this confusing to you?
- 22 A. It was because of the email identifier. My
- 23 vehicles, at the time I think I had two major vehicles
- 24 but neither one was in my name. You know, telephone
- 25 number, you know, I never asked about what number two

- 1 telephone number was, but email, internet identifiers,
- 2 that part, and user screen names confused me because
- ${f 3}$ where I would work some of those emails were not my
- 4 emails but I had to use that email.
- **5 Q.** Did you ever seek out guidance from anyone to
- 6 kind of clarify your confusion on any of this
- 7 information?
- 8 A. When it came to -- not on this, sorry, not on
- 9 this I did not.
- **10 Q**. When you say this, what do you mean, what are you
- 11 speaking of?
- 12 A. There was an incident where it came to my
- 13 daughter's school and being at events where I would try
- 14 to get information of am I allowed to be there, am I not
- 15 allowed to be there, so that. But on this form I did
- 16 not.
- 17 Q. Okay. So you'd mentioned some confusion about
- 18 vehicles?
- 19 A. Correct.
- **Q.** And you'd mentioned you had two vehicles that you
- 21 would use or operate; is that correct?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. What's your understanding of using something, to
- 24 use something?
- 25 A. I mean I'm using it, I'm using it either to go to

- 1 operate, any vehicle that you would drive would be
- ! required to be recorded on this form?
- 3 A. According to the way it's worded operate would be 4 drive.
- **5 Q.** So you're really not confused about what vehicle
- 6 needs to be reported on this form, then, correct?
- 7 A. Like I said, by the definition of operate then,8 no, I'm not confused.
- **Q.** Okay. I'm going to highlight the second
- 10 sentence -- or another one here, it's under I, do you
- 11 see that or do you need me to zoom in at all?
- 12 A. No, I can see it.
- **Q.** Okay. So based off of your reading of that do
- **14** you need to register your email address or other
- 15 identifiers, internet identifiers, on this form now?
 - A. Considering my offense was in 2003 I do not, according to what that says.
- **Q.** And that's not confusing to you at all, right?
- 19 A. Correct, because it's after my conviction so I'm
- 20 before that so that would not apply to me.
- **Q.** If you had any questions about any of the
- 22 information requested here would you seek advice from
- 23 anyone?

17

- 24 A. I would at least try to see the officer if -- I
- 25 would ask maybe them a question if I saw the form before

59

- work or I'm using it to run to the store. It's not
- 2 something that I physically own.
- **Q.** And just to clarify, you've never seen this form
- 4 before?

1

- ${\bf 5} \qquad {\bf A.} \quad {\bf The \ application, \ all \ that \ information \ form \ I \ have}$
- 6 not. The next page I have seen it once I've signed.
- 7 I'm not allowed -- they don't let me see it before I
- 8 sign it.
- **9 Q.** Could you elaborate on that? You're not allowed
- 10 to see it before you sign it?
- 11 A. So when I go to verify they just ask if there's
- 12 any changes, which to me is my address and my name, and
- 13 then they just say sign here and I sign it and then
- 14 I -- they ask me do I want a copy. So I don't see any
- 15 of this until after I'm done signing.
- **16 Q.** So this isn't presented to you at all whenever
- 17 you go to sign to give your information updates?
- 18 A. Correct
- **19 Q.** If you look here, I'm going across, the license
- 20 plate number and description of any vehicle that I own
- 21 or operate, do you see that?
- 22 A. Yes.
- **Q.** What's your understanding of the word operate?
- 24 A. Drive.
- **25 Q.** So based off of your understanding of the word

- 1 I did verification.
- 2 Q. Okay. And so you understand that not filling
- 3 this form out correctly, I'm scrolling down to here and
- 4 highlighting this portion on page two of this, failure
- **5** to register as required by law is a felony and may
- **6** result in prosecution. So to be able to avoid that you
- 7 would make sure to go and clarify any of this
- **8** information is required?
- 9 A. After I've already signed it, you know, I can't
- 10 go back and change it till my next verification.
- 11 Q. Okay, so then assuming -- between the time you
- 12 signed it and then your next verification you think
- 13 like, oh, man, there's something on here I really didn't
- 14 understand, would you reach out and try to get an answer
- 15 from anyone to try to guide you on it?
- 16 A. Honestly I can just say, you know, I might reach 17 out to the ACLU.
- **18 Q.** So you'd seek legal advice?
 - A. Try to find out maybe some understanding of it.
- **Q.** I'll stop sharing my screen. Do you think the
- 21 sex offender registry protects the public in any way?
- A. Yes and no. Yes for the ones that are out there,
- you know, non-stop, you know, sexual behaviors with minors. You know, the ones that make a mistake, you
- 24 minors. You know, the ones that make a mistake, you
- 25 know, to be, you know -- not to be on there for a

11

13

22

1

8

1 lifetime. I mean it does and it doesn't.

Q. Okay. So for those individuals that are outthere, like you said, that are out there offending all

4 the time, how do you think that the registry protects

5 the public?

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

A. If that person is out there like all the time like non-stop -- well, first of all they shouldn't be out there, you know. And it can be harmful also, I mean it can hurt even those ones that are out there. It's a very misplaced and fumbled water completely.

Q. Okay. But focusing on those individuals that you would deem dangerous, is that a fair way to describe somebody that you think should be on the registry?

A. But my way of seeing someone dangerous is somebody else's way of saying, oh, they are not dangerous. So if we're talking about my way of someone being dangerous, then it might be good.

Q. And why do you -- and how do you think it would be good, like what benefits would it have?

A. You know, I feel like if there's a public registry for this then I would want to know if, you know, the person next to me committed like five murders I'd want to know that. I would want to know if the person next to me might have committed like 30 -- was

to be -- consider someone to be on a registry, in youropinion?

3 MS. DAVIDSON: Objection, foundation, calls

4 for speculation, also she's not an expert.

THE WITNESS: I don't know. I can onlyspeak about my experience.

MR. DAMICH: Before we move on, the first

8 exhibit I showed, I'd like to offer it as Exhibit A to

9 this deposition.

(Whereupon Deposition Exhibits A & B marked for identification.)

12 BY MR. DAMICH:

Q. I'm going to share my screen again, ma'am.

MS. DAVIDSON: Before you start questioning
on this, Scott, I understand that due to the court's
order you are permitted to ask certain questions so long

17 as they don't become impermissibly oppressive. However,

18 I'd still like to place a standing objection on the

record to any line of questioning related to this

exhibit for the reasons articulated to the court at thestatus conference in our memo.

MR. DAMICH: Your objection's noted.

23 BY MR. DAMICH:

Q. First of all, can you see the new document sharedon the screen?

63

Q. Okay. Who do you think should make that determination of whether or not they are dangerous or not to be on the list?

incarcerated like multiple times for the same thing.

A. I don't have an answer for that. I would say, you know, it should be a committee of doctors and officials, you know, that each case should be determined, you know. For someone like me it was a one event 20 years ago and I'm now for my lifetime till the day I die I have to register for something that I made a mistake and I acknowledge what I did was wrong.

Q. Do you think the sex offender registry may encourage victims to come forward?MS. DAVIDSON: Objection, calls for

MS. DAVIDSON: Objection, calls for speculation.

THE WITNESS: I don't know.

16 BY MR. DAMICH:

Q. So if victims come forward and report sex crimesdoes that protect the public?

19 A. It could.

20 Q. How?

A. Well, it depends. I mean if it's the same person over and over and over again then the public would know like this is that one person, they are doing it again and again and again.

Q. So it takes multiple violations of criminal code

A. Yes.

Q. I'm going to scroll all the way up to the top.

3 And what this is here, it's a random selection of cases

4 of criminal sexual conduct in Michigan. And I want to

5 point you to this number 21. Could you read the text of

6 that? You don't have to read it out loud, just let me

7 know when you're done reading it.

A. Okav.

9 Q. Just let me know when you're done.

10 A. Okay.

11 Q. Would you want to know if this perpetrator lived

12 next door to you?

13 A. I will tell you, first of all, while I read it it

14 just disturbed me in every way, shape, and form.

15 Honestly, I would hope the person didn't live next to

16 me.

19

22

25

Q. So the question was would you want to know if

18 this perpetrator lived next door?

A. In reality, yes.

Q. Go ahead and read number 25.

21 A. Okay.

Q. Okay. Would you want to know if this perpetrator

23 would be the teacher of any of your grandchildren?

24 A. I'm going to say, first of all, that the

teacher's probably no longer teaching so I wouldn't have

Page 66 to 69 of 86

18 of 33 sheets

Case 2:22-cv-10209-MAG-Cl ECF No. 125-10, PageID.5223 Filed 10/02/23 Page 20 of 2/2 1 Q. Do you think the individual is a threat? speculation. 2 A. No. 2 THE WITNESS: I couldn't say yes or no. 3 MS. DAVIDSON: Objection, asked and 3 BY MR. DAMICH: 4 answered. I think she answered it the way she's going 5 to answer it.

6 BY MR. DAMICH: 7 Q. Okay. Can you read number 32?

8 A. Okay.

9 Q. Would you want to know if this perpetrator lived

10 next door?

11 A. No.

12 Q. Why not?

13 A. There's no reason for me to assume that, you

14 know, what really happened I mean just from reading

15 that.

16 **Q**. So just for clarification, these are from actual 17 lawsuits and reported from a judicial opinion, so this

18 did happen. So with knowing that would you want to know

19 whether this perpetrator lived next door?

20 A. Honestly, no.

21 Q. You don't believe he's a threat?

22 A. No. I don't know the person, I don't know if

23 that person's a threat, I don't know what occurred after

24 the event. All I'm getting is just a little blurb of

25 what happened. There's nothing that tells me what any

Q. If you knew the information about this individual and you knew that they were going on a date together would you let your grandchildren or children know?

7 A. Am I assuming all of this or --

8 Q. Yeah.

9 MS. DAVIDSON: Objection, calls for

10 speculation.

11 THE WITNESS: Yeah, I mean I couldn't tell 12 you yes or no. I mean we're talking 20 years and, you 13 know, my kids are all grown and it's their parents that 14 are left to raise them and screen their boyfriends or

15 girlfriends.

16 BY MR. DAMICH:

17 Q. So even if you had access to this information and 18 you knew they were going out on a date with this 19 individual you wouldn't tell them?

20 MS. DAVIDSON: Objection, asked and 21 answered. She answered that question the way she's 22 going to answer.

23 THE WITNESS: Like I said, I mean, my kids 24 are all grown. My grandkids, that's up to their parents 25 to deal with whoever they are dating.

73

71

of the aftereffects have ever been.

2 Q. Do you think it's appropriate to ask a seven year 3 old to hold your penis?

4 A. No.

1

7

10

11

12

16

5 Q. Okay, number 34, would you read that one.

6

Q. Okay, would you want to know this information

8 before sending any of your grandchildren or children to

9 religious education with this individual?

A. Considering that I'm not involved in a church, synagogue and have nothing to do with my grandchildren's upbringing it's hard for me to answer this question.

13 Q. Okay. Now, assuming you were sending your 14 children or grandchildren to this person for any kind of 15 tutoring, would you want to know this information?

A. Honestly I don't know.

17 Q. Okay.

18 A. I mean these are scenarios that you're asking me 19 to make a decision on and I can't.

20 **Q**. Okay, number 57, can you read that one?

21

19 of 33 sheets

22 Q. Do you think any of your grandchildren or

23 children would want to know this information about this

24 perpetrator before going on a blind date with him?

25 MS. DAVIDSON: Objection, it calls for

BY MR. DAMICH: 1

2 Q. Okay, if you would read number 61.

3 A. Okay.

4 Q. Would you want to live next door to this

5 individual?

6

7

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

A. You know, honestly, I would say the 15 year old girl when she came down and saw the bed she should have just left the house, that's my honest answer. Do I want to know? This isn't going to have an impact on me whether or not my neighbor next door is this person, it's just not. It's not my reality of how I'm living

Q. Do you have any opinions about whether any of these individuals that we went through may be more or less likely than someone who has not been convicted of criminal sexual conduct to commit another sex offense?

and wanting to know who my next door neighbor is.

MS. DAVIDSON: Objection, I believe the court order is that you specifically cannot ask about recidivism. Don't answer that.

20 MR. DAMICH: I believe you're right, thank 21 you, I appreciate that. She's correct, I apologize.

22 BY MR. DAMICH:

23 Q. Have you ever contacted a member of the Michigan 24 legislature to inquire about changing the sex offender 25 registration law?

Page 70 to 73 of 86

Case 2:22-cv-10209-MAG-Cl ECF No. 125-10, PageID.5224 Filed 10/02/23 Page 21 of 24 1 A. I have not. is easier than actually physically delivering it to the intended location, correct? 2 Q. Okay. And are you aware that it's the 3 legislature that has the power to change the law? 3 A. Probably. I mean it's just -- it's still just as 4 A. I really don't. I'm not political, laws, nowhere hard because, you know, do you have to send a copy of 5 in my wheelhouse. your driver's license with it or is it just, you know, 6 Q. Do you know whether Governor Whitmer has the you can just fill out the form. power to change the sex offender registration law? 7 7 Q. Sure, I'm talking about just the actual physical 8 MS. DAVIDSON: Objection, foundation. 8 delivery of the thing, contents aside. 9 THE WITNESS: Honestly, I don't know. 9 A. Contents aside? 10 BY MR. DAMICH: 10 Q. Content aside. 11 Q. Do you know whether she can reduce the 11 A. Probably if I had an envelope laying around the 12 12 house and a stamp, then probably it might be easier. registration period? 13 13 MR. DAMICH: Okay, I don't have any further A. I don't know. 14 MS. DAVIDSON: Objection, asked and 14 questions. 15 MS. DAVIDSON: I'll have a little bit of 15 answered. 16 BY MR. DAMICH: 16 follow up but can I have like five minutes? 17 MR. DAMICH: Of course. 17 **Q.** You still have to answer the question. 18 18 MS. DAVIDSON: Thanks. A. I don't. 19 Q. Do you know whether Colonel Gasper has the power 19 (A recess was taken.) 20 to change the sex offender registration law? 20 **EXAMINATION** 21 21 A. I don't even know who that is. BY MS. DAVIDSON: 22 22 Q. Do you know you're suing him? Q. All right, Ms. Doe, you are not on public 23 23 registry any more, correct? A. I don't. 24 24 Q. Do you know under the new law that some of the A. Correct. 25 changes can be made via mail instead of in person? 25 Q. Do you remember when you came off? 1 1 A. Right about when Does 1 was filed, I want to say. A. From the form you showed me I saw that. 2 2 Q. Okay. Would you agree that making the changes by **Q.** Do you recall approximately what year that was? 3 3 mail is easier than making those changes in person? A. I want to say it was about 2014. 4 4 A. No, I think it would be just as difficult. **Q.** I want to draw your attention to your testimony 5 Q. Why would it be just as difficult? that your daughter received backlash from you being on 6 A. Depending on what information you need to verify. 6 the public registry. Do you remember giving that 7 7 testimony? Honestly when I had to verify my new addresses it wasn't 8 easier or harder whether or not I had to do it, you 8 A. Yes. 9 know, in person or in mail. Like in 2019 when I moved I 9 Q. What was the backlash that your daughter 10 didn't know I could have done it by mail, I still went, 10 received? 11 11 did it how I normally did it, I went in. A. Not only from my own family, my siblings, who 12 12 **Q.** Did you have to adjust your schedule to go in would constantly bring it up to my daughter, who knew, 13 and --13 she knew at a young age, not by my choice, about what 14 A. I -- go ahead. 14 happened to me, but, you know, friends she met, friends 15 Q. I'm sorry. We did a good job till this point of 15 from school, their parents knew. It was -- it was very, 16 not interrupting each other so it's two hours in the 16 very difficult for her to have that strong exterior all 17 17 first time so kudos. Did you have to adjust your the time knowing how people felt about her mother. 18 schedule in the past when you would have to actually go 18 Q. You're saying -- I'm sorry, go ahead, I didn't 19 and report physically to the police station? 19 know you weren't done. 20 A. Yes. 20 A. There were a couple friends that she couldn't be 21 21 Q. Would you have to adjust your schedule any more friends with because of me and she wanted to be friends 22 22 if you simply have to mail in the information? with them but because of my status being on the public 23 A. I don't know because I don't use the mail one at 23 registry, also having my CSC, they weren't allowing it. 24 all. 24 **Q.** Okay. You also mentioned that your daughter had 25 Q. You would agree, though, that mailing something 25 issues related to parent/teacher conferences and school

1 work?

5

- A. Yes. 2
- 3 Q. Can you elaborate on how that was related to you 4 being on the public registry?
 - A. Because of the school that she went to having to be in the Jewish community they all knew about my past.
- 6
- 7 It's a community, everybody knows everybody. We know
- 8 everybody's secrets here and there, everybody's past, if
- 9 you don't know them, you know their parents, you know
- 10 their parents' parents. I had teachers that wouldn't
- 11 communicate with me, it would take days for them to get
- 12 back to me regarding anything that was happening in
- 13 school, but my ex-husband at the time, they would answer
- 14 him almost immediately. So it was like almost I
- 15 couldn't coparent.
- 16 Q. You also testified that at the conclusion of your
- 17 own education it was hard for you to find employment.
- 18 Do you recall giving that testimony?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. Can you elaborate on how it was hard for you to
- 21 find employment?
- 22 A. Due to me having my conviction and being on the
- 23 public registry the school happened to note that even
- 24 though I graduated top of the class and I should have
- 25 had an easy time finding a position it was very

- had come to such a good place that we were able to come
 - together as one big family, all of us, to be there to
- support her as she took the next step in her life.
- 4 And now my grandkids, it's been great, I go
- 5 to their sporting events, get to see them, you know,
- 6 either win or lose, you know, do well in their music
- concerts. It's nice not having that looming over me, 7
- 8 that I'm able to be there and enjoy everything as a
- 9 family, that, you know, Nana gets to be there, you know.
- 10 There's no question of, well, where's Nana, like Nana's
- 11 there.

13

19

- 12 Q. Thank you. Do you need a moment?
 - A. Yeah, just a second. Okay, sorry.
- 14 Q. That's okay. Are you ready to continue?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. All right. Did you have social media when you
- were on the public registry? 17
- 18 A. I did not.
 - Q. Whv?
- 20 A. The restrictions, the -- all the information
- 21 required, it was just a lot, you know. There were so
- 22 many things outlined that it was very confusing with the
- 23 registry, you know, saying, you know, you can't have
- 24 social media, I believe. I mean it was very -- there
- 25 were a lot of restrictions to understand and it was just

79

- difficult because of the registry along with the
- 2 conviction.

1

11

- 3 **Q.** How did you know it was because of the registry?
- 4 A. Because that I was still on, you know, publicly
- 5 on that registry where you could search me, find me on
- 6 that registry, know everything about me. It didn't
- 7 matter how well of a student I was, you know, I -- even
- 8 when I sought employment and I was working for a doctor
- 9 someone came in, told them I was on the registry, he
- 10 went and looked and I lost my job because of that.
 - **Q.** Okay. And to switch gears here, you also
- 12 testified that it's easier for you to be involved with
- 13 your grandchildren than it was for you to be involved
- 14 with your daughter because you're no longer on the
- 15 public registry.
- 16 A. Correct.
- 17 **Q.** Can you elaborate on that?
- 18 A. Yes. My daughter, I missed her eighth grade
- 19 graduation. If her -- anything that she was involved
- 20 with at school happened on school grounds, I missed out
- 21 on all of it. When I came off that public registry I
- 22 was able to go to her high school graduation,
- 23 that -- sorry, that meant the most to me, to be able to 24
- see my daughter walk across stage after everything she 25 had gone through. And the fact that me and her father

- 1 easier for me not to be involved with any of it and just
- 2 not to have any of it.
- 3 Q. Lastly you tes- -- well, not lastly, but you
- testified that the registry is and it isn't helpful to 4
- 5 the public; do you remember that testimony?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Can you elaborate on how you feel that the
- 8 registry isn't helpful to the public?
- A. It's not helpful for people like me.
- 10 **Q.** What do you mean by people like you?
- 11 A. I made a mistake when I was 29 years old, I've
- 12 paid for it, I got sentenced, I served my time, I was
- 13 judged, I did my probation following all the rules, to
- 14 this day still following rules in society. And for me
- 15 to have to sit there and go from ten, then to 25, and
- now it's for life for someone that I made a mistake when 16
- 17 I was 29. It's 20 years later I'm still paying for that
- 18 mistake being on that registry for life instead of me
- 19 being -- someone saying, you know, oh, well, look at
- 20 this person, she's rebuilt her life, you know, she's
- 21 done everything, she's not, you know, a habitual or a
- 23 needs to do and she's lowest risk possible, there's no

sexual deviant, you know, she has done everything she

- 24 way she will ever offend again. It's not helpful for
- 25 someone like me or other people like me.

STATE OF MICHIGAN)) SS COUNTY OF INGHAM) I, Melinda Nardone, Certified Shorthand 3 Reporter and Notary Public in and for the County of 4 5 Ingham, State of Michigan, do hereby certify that the 6 foregoing deposition was taken before me at the time hereinbefore set forth. 7 8 I further certify that said witness was duly sworn in said cause to tell the truth; that the 9 10 testimony then given was reported by me remotely to the best of my ability; subsequently produced under my 11 direction and supervision; and that the foregoing is a 12 13 complete, true, and correct transcript of my original 14 shorthand notes. IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set 15 my hand and seal this 5th day of April, 2023. 16 17 18 19 Melinda S. Nardone, CSR-1311, 20 Certified Shorthand Reporter, and Notary Public, County 21 of Ingham, State of Michigan. My Commission Expires: 10-24-24 22 23 24 25